Navigating multiple rounds of review: an author and reviewer’s perspective

“I would like to thank you, the team at Emerald, and the reviewers for the support during the course of publication. I would also like to especially thank the Associate Editor for the valuable suggestions that helped me refine the case to bring it to the final stage.”

Hemant K. Manuj, Associate Professor & Finance Area Head, S. P. Jain Institute of Management and Research.

Introduction

As the editorial team for Emerald’s Emerging Markets Case Studies, we recently had the opportunity to work with Dr. Hemant K. Manuj on his case study on Bhushan Steel, now known as Tata Steel BSL, the largest manufacturer of auto-grade steel in India. Hemant’s case was submitted in February 2018, and was accepted in March 2019 after five rounds of review. He agreed to share his experience of the review process as useful guidance to others navigating the case study review process.

Diligent reviewers

The Bhushan Steel case originally relied strongly on secondary sources of data and had an under-developed protagonist. The reviewers were positive about the potential of the case and provided substantial content suggestions. Hemant credits their “diligent reading of the case, applying their minds to it, and then providing feedback on the same.” He found the “specific improvements” from two reviewers more helpful than the “several generic changes” from another. Importantly, Hemant included a point-by-point response to reviewer comments, which helped reviewers and the editorial team to assess the extent to which the feedback had been considered and integrated.

Ensuring global relevance

The case was managed by Dr. Virginia Bodolica, one of our eight Associate Editors, who is also the Said T. Khoury Chair of Leadership Studies and a Professor of Management at American University of Sharjah. In addition to providing oversight of the process and guidance to Hemant about how to prioritise the reviewer feedback, Virginia also needed to provide specific advice about meeting our quality requirements: “It was very important to provide the author with clear point-by-point guidance on how to proceed, and what exactly to do in order to enhance both the case and teaching note.” Virginia and Hemant discussed how to enhance the case in order to be better received by students and instructors around the world (in 2018, over 75,000 EMCS cases were downloaded from institutions in the UK, Australia, Malaysia, India, South Africa, Egypt, Hong Kong, Pakistan, China, Mexico, and others). Virginia noticed that Hemant’s responsiveness to her guidance increased through the process, while Hemant sometimes wondered whether the law of diminishing returns might apply to some of the final revisions. In the end, Virginia was “very pleased to see how the case was maturing and improving throughout the review process, to become a really valuable teaching tool that many finance instructors would enjoy using in their classes.”
Lessons learned

Hemant learned three important lessons from the review process. Firstly, that it is important to ensure that the case narrative is “lucid” for students, including the flow, style, and level of details required. Secondly, Hemant acknowledged that the process could be lengthy and that an author could be impatient at times. Lastly, he was reminded that preparing a more comprehensive first submission helps.

The Bhushan Steel case will be published spring 2019 and available for download at www.emeraldinsight.com/loi/eemcs

The case documents the company’s unsuccessful attempt to restructure their debt and their ultimate insolvency in 2017. It provides important credit risk appraisal, corporate governance, and finance lessons to students and managers.

About Emerging Markets Case Studies (EMCS)

EMCS is an online collection of peer-reviewed case studies focusing on business decision making and management development throughout key global emerging markets. Cases are written by case writers working in or closely with developing economies, offering local perspectives with global appeal.

We welcome new submissions – for more information and full author guidelines see www.emeraldgrouppublishing.com/products/case_studies/authors.htm

Want to know more about the case writing process? Emerald’s Cases Learning Hub is a free online resource with guidance from our Editors and Advisors on the process of writing a case from thinking about getting to started right though to submitting it for publication. Register for full access at caseshub.emeraldgrouppublishing.com

Virginia Bodolica is The Said T. Khoury Chair of Leadership Studies and a Professor of Management in the School of Business Administration at the American University of Sharjah in the UAE. Her research interests are related to corporate leadership dynamics and soft and hard governance issues in for-profit settings, family-owned enterprises and healthcare institutions. She co-authored and co-edited several books, including Mergers and Acquisitions and Executive Compensation, Corporate Governance in Arab Countries, and Managing Organizations in the United Arab Emirates. She is an avid writer of case studies, serves on the editorial board of a number of academic journals, consults with local and international businesses, facilitates strategic retreats and delivers executive education sessions and customized programs, and is regularly invited as a guest speaker at professional conferences, workshops and events. Her involvement in service activities has earned her many Outstanding Reviewer Awards from scholarly journals and various Academy of Management’s divisions.

Hemant Manuj is an Associate Professor and the Head of the Finance Area at S P Jain Institute of Management & Research (SPJIMR), at Mumbai, India. He teaches multiple courses in Finance which include Corporate Finance, Securities and Portfolio Management, and Financial Risk Management. Previously, he has worked in the corporate sector for over two decades in the areas of securities regulation, fund management, equity research, risk management, portfolio management, and stressed assets prediction and resolution. Dr Manuj is a Fellow in Management (Finance & Control) from the Indian Institute of Management, Calcutta and a certified Financial Risk Manager from the Global Association of Risk Professionals (GARP). He is also a qualified engineer and management accountant. He researches, publishes, and blogs extensively on industry related topics in corporate finance and markets. Dr Manuj also engages closely with the industry through consulting and advisory roles and independent directorships.

This case study is now published and can be viewed at: emeraldinsight.com/doi/full/10.1108/EEMCS-12-2017-0263