Choosing the winners of the...

OUTSTANDING PAPER AWARDS

For over 20 years, the Outstanding Paper Awards have been the backbone of the Emerald Literati Awards for Excellence. As the winners are chosen by a journal editorial team, the winning authors have confidence in knowing that their paper was one of the most impressive pieces of work from the previous year; therefore, winning this award helps to enrich an author’s CV and future publications.

Understanding the Judging Process

The Editorial Advisory Board (EAB) of each journal published by Emerald is invited to select a winner of the 'Outstanding Paper' award and up to three ‘Highly Commended’ awards from the previous year’s volume.

As the EAB is familiar with the aims of a particular journal and familiar with its editorial objectives and the prevailing standards of current paper and research, they are the best people for the job!

Here are a number of ways in which an editor can work with the EAB to pick an outstanding paper:

- Some editors compile a shortlist of those papers which may merit the nomination; the EAB members will then vote for their preferred choice
- Some editors allow the EAB members to nominate papers, produce a shortlist and then all vote again
- An editor asks the EAB to pick three papers and rank them with a numerical score (1-3). When all EAB members’ choices are collated, there is then usually one clear winner.

Award winning Criteria

The following factors are prerequisites in any paper:

- Contribution of something new to the body of knowledge either in terms of approach or subject matter
- Excellent structure and presentation
- Well-written
- Rigour in terms of argument or analysis
- Relevance – to practice and further research, in most cases
- Up-to-date – demonstrating that the latest/key works in the field have been cited

A work which is clearly within the editorial scope and remit of the journal.

Over and above those factors, different types of paper require different approaches and content. A top quality literature review, an innovative conceptual exploration and a really well-constructed case study will do different things and can all demonstrate excellence in their own way.

The Deciding Factor

Ultimately, an outstanding paper should have the ‘x-factor’ – something that makes it stand out from the rest and which the editor and EAB can recognize and define for the rest of us.

Good Luck!